

IL EE Low Income Advisory Committee Formation Meeting

Tuesday, April 11, 2017

12:30 – 5:00

**Metropolitan Mayors Caucus / CMAP
233 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 800
Chicago, IL 60606**

Attendee List and Action Items

Attendee List

Annette Beitel, SAG Facilitation
Ashley Palladino, SAG Facilitation
Agnes Mrozowski, Ameren Illinois
Aimee Gendusa-English, Citizens Utility Board (CUB)
Alison Giangrasso, CLEAResult
Andrea Inouye, Illinois Housing Council
Andrew Braatz, Nexant
Andrew Cottrell, Applied Energy Group
Andrey Gribovich, DNVGL
Anne Evans, Elevate Energy
Anne McKibben, Elevate Energy
Anne Mitchell, Rooney, Rippie & Ratnaswamy, LLP on behalf of Nicor Gas
Antonia Ornelas, Elevate Energy
Ashley Munson, Illinois Environmental Council
Blaine Fox, CMC Energy Services
Rev. Booker Steven Vance, Faith in Place
Bridgid Lutz, Nicor Gas
Bryan Tillman, 360 Energy Group
Chantal Jones, ComEd
Chris Neme, Energy Futures Group, on behalf of NRDC
Chris Vaughn, Nicor Gas
Christie Hicks, Environmental Defense Fund
Clair Cowan, Seventh Wave
Clare Butterfield, ISEIF
Dalitso Sulamoyo, Illinois Association of Community Action Agencies
Dan LeFevers, Gas Technology Institute (GTI)
Dan Maksymiw, CEDA
David Ortiz, The Ortiz Group
David Baker, Energy Resources Center, UIC

David Goodrich, Madison County, IL
Debra Perry, Ameren IL
Delia Farmer, East Central Illinois Community Action Agency
Delmar Gillus, Elevate Energy
Edith Makra, Metropolitan Mayors Caucus (MMC)
Ellen Bell, Environmental Defense Fund
Ellen Sargent, Chicago Housing Authority
Erin Daughton, ComEd
Erin Stitz, Applied Energy Group (AEG), on behalf of Peoples Gas – North Shore Gas (PG-NSG)
Hammad Chaudhry, Nicor Gas
Jack Erffmeyer, CUB
Jaime Peters, Energy Savvy
Jean Ascoli, ComEd
Jen Morris, ICC Staff
Jennifer Martin
Jessica Collingsworth, Union of Concerned Scientists
Jim Fay, ComEd
Jim Heffron, Franklin Energy, on behalf of PG-NSG
Jim Jerozal, Nicor Gas
Jim Zolnierak, ICC
John Madziarczyk, Nicor Gas
John Pady, CEDA
Jonathan Feipel
Julia Friedman, MEEA
Juliana Pino, Little Village Environmental Justice Organization
K.C. Doyle, Cook County, Department of Environmental Control
Karen Lusson, IL Attorney General's Office
Kate Brown, Building Research Council, University of Illinois Urbana - Champaign
Kathleen Walk, CEFS Economic Opportunity Corporation
Keith Martin, Ameren IL
Ken Woolcutt, Ameren IL
Kevin Dick, Delta Institute
Koby Bailey, PG-NSG
LaJuana Garrett, Nicor Gas
Laura Oakleaf, Cook County
Laura Goldberg, NRDC
Lauren Casentini, Resource Innovations
Lauren Pashayan, Land of Lincoln Legal Assistance Foundation
Leanna McKeon, Chicago Housing Authority
Leslie DeVore, DCEO

Mack Shaughnessy, Navigant
Margaret Garascia, Elevate Energy
Margaret Hansbrough, City of Chicago
Mark Pruitt, MMC
Mary Ellen Guest, Chicago Bungalow Association
McFarland Bragg II, Peoria Citizens Committee for Economic Opportunity
Mick Prince, DCEO
Mike Brandt, ComEd
Mike King, Nicor Gas
Mike Marks, AEG on behalf of PG-NSG
Mindy Browning, Embarras River Basin Agency, Inc.
Molly Lunn, Department
Nick Lovier, Ameren
Noel Corral, ComEd
Paige Knutsen, Franklin Energy
Pat Michalkiewicz, PG-NSG
Patricia Plympton, Navigant
Peter Ludwig, Elevate Energy
Philip Mosenthal, Optimal Energy on behalf of the AG's Office
Randy Gunn, Navigant
Rick Bain, Embertec
Rob Neumann, Navigant
Robert Hilgenbrink, Southwestern Illinois College
Sandra Henry, Seventh Wave
Sarah Moskowitz, CUB
Scott Allen, CUB
Sharon Durbin, Land of Lincoln Goodwill
Shraddha Mutyal, UIC
Stacie Young, CIC Chicago
Stacy Gloss, UIC
Suzanne Stelmasek, Elevate Energy
Tamara Dzubay, Environmental Law and Policy Center
Tim Gibson, John A Logan College
Torsten Clausen, ICC
Vincent Gutierrez, ComEd
Wade Morehead, CLEAResult

Meeting Notes and Action Items

Action items are indicated in **yellow** highlight.

Introduction, Stakeholder Memo and Feedback –

Summary Notes and Recommendations:

1. Objectives and Principles –

- *Shared by Low Income Coalition Stakeholders: Juliana Pino, Rev. Vance, Delmar Gillus, Anne McKibbin, Laura Goldberg, Julia Friedman, Mary Ellen Guest, Ashley Munson*
 - Transparency – meetings are noticed, notes, materials are provided and accessible (meeting location rotates, remote call-in webinar is available and effective)
 - Ensure meetings are accessible to those individuals who don't typically participate in the SAG – adjust logistics, approach to meetings to accommodate new participants
 - Include low income communities in the discussion – not simply be present/represented at the meetings, but allow them to have a voice, provide input, be heard
 - Ensure location is accessible, time of day works
 - Expand list of invitees, need input from all stakeholders on organizations and contacts (all input should be shared with Ashley Palladino at ashley.palladino@futee.biz)
 - Clear and consistent marketing is essential, avoid confusion in the market, ensure offers are easy for housing to present to their customers and residents
 - SAG is very technical, ensure information in Low Income Advisory Committee meetings is geared toward audience
 - Short planning period should not inhibit ability for the process to be effective and impactful; the Coalition is willing to participate fully and does not want the discussion and opportunity to coordinate to be limited due to the planning timeframe
 - Foster trust in the community – this is a priority issue with customers, many don't trust the utilities or other institutions, the participating organizations can support efforts to build trust in the community.
 - Coordination – both gas/electric, and throughout the state, is essential
- *Shared by Karen Lusson, AG's Office*

- Maximize funding for this segment
- Treat low income offers as an energy justice issue
- Listen to the Coalition and other participants, those who have the experience and relationships in the community
- Don't reinvent the wheel, leverage existing programs and lessons learned
- Reduce the number of contract levels to limit administrative costs
- *Shared by the electric utilities – Mike Brandt, ComEd, Keith Martin, Ameren IL*
 - Utility goals are well aligned with what was shared by the Coalition and other stakeholders

2. “Logistics”

- **Committee Structure:**
 - One advisory group, facilitated and coordinated with SAG
 - Establish two working groups – North (ComEd) and South (Ameren IL)
 - Open participation, with a core group that leads/drives
- **Location:**
 - Downtown Chicago is not ideal
 - Other options outside of the city, within communities –
 - Utility facilities
 - ComEd 35th Street training facility
 - Chicago Housing Authority
 - Southern meetings – Peoria and Springfield considered
 - Springfield is more accessible, approximately 2 hours from most participants, easy access by train, allows ICC staff to participate
 - DCEO and Land of Lincoln Goodwill Industries offered facilities
 - Peoria is more remote but has its own needs
 - Rotate locations to allow all participants to attend in-person
 - Locations and frequency to be discussed by “Procedures Subcommittee” (“nuts and bolts”).
- **Frequency:**
 - Will vary by “phase”
- **Co-chair / co-lead / champion:**
 - Need to establish, request “nominations” from participants for positions

- Role requires a time commitment, which will need to be approved by some organizations for participation
 - **Rules / Procedures:**
 - These will take time to establish.
 - Procedures (“nuts and bolts”) Subcommittee will focus on immediate items; dedicated subcommittee may be formed
 - SAG Facilitation to share existing procedures for consideration
- 3. Subcommittee Plan**
- SAG Facilitation will update and distribute the draft subcommittee plan for review by the Committee
 - Will include key dates, decisions, topics to address
 - Initial draft will be focused on immediate term, prior to June 30, 2017 filing.
- 4. Major Meetings / Milestone Schedule**
- Summarize critical dates for coming months –
 - Bridge period
 - Filing due date
 - Request visibility into –
 - Contracting for Bridge period and new programs starting January, 2018
 - Requests for Proposals (RFPs)
 - Major program design, implementation, etc. decisions
- 5. Immediate Term – Now to Utility Filing (June 30, 2017)**
- 3 in-person meetings:
 - April 11, 2017
 - Late May, after utilities present more detailed plans for comment (to be held in Springfield)
 - Early June, identify areas of consensus/non-consensus re: program filings (to be held in Chicago Metro area outside of downtown, ideally ComEd facility in South Chicago)
 - Meeting topics and priorities:
 - Utilities suggested some topics are not a priority to be addressed by the Committee prior to the filings, as not all details are finalized in utility filing.
- 6. Post-Filing Term – After June 30, 2017**
- Logistics and topics to be addressed closer to date.

Next Steps and Follow Up Items:

1. Meeting Schedule and Meeting Notices

- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation will send out a detailed schedule for the Low Income Advisory Committee meeting, with meeting notices.

2. Attendees

- SAG Facilitation will create a new participant list and distribution for the Committee.
- The current list is not exhaustive, and additional input is needed.
- **Action Item:** All participants are encouraged to submit contact names, organizations for addition to the committee to ashley.palladino@futee.biz.
- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation will post a participating organizations list to the SAG website, new additions will be added as received. Contact information for individuals will not be posted publicly and new contacts should be submitted for addition to the distribution list.

3. Procedures Subcommittee

- **Action Item:** “Nuts and bolts” to be discussed by a subcommittee, Delmar Gillus to lead with coordination support by SAG Facilitation
- **Action Item:** Interested participants should email Ashley Palladino (ashley.palladino@futee.biz) and Delmar Gillus (Delmar.Gillus@elevateenergy.org) to join.
- **Action Item:** Subcommittee charter, including topics to be discussed, meeting schedule, will be distributed to the full Committee.

4. Meeting Topics

- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation will document topics during the May and June meetings which may be deferred until after the utility filings – those that are not essential to be covered prior to the utility filings. Pre-filing meetings to be focused on measures, market segment, savings, budget, framework; delivery mechanisms, implementers, program specifics determined after/separate of filings.

5. Subcommittee Plan

- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation will distribute the Subcommittee Plan to the full Committee for review and comment.

6. Critical Dates

- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation will maintain a calendar of critical dates for the Committee (see the last page for a current version).
- **Action Item:** Utilities will provide updates on other critical items as available, including low income program RFPs, contracting, etc.

ComEd Presentation –

Summary Notes and Recommendations:

1. Health and Safety:

- Does \$500 average per home align with experience?
- Expand to include other “readiness” or other structural improvements (e.g., roof repairs, leaks, wiring/electrical issues, etc.)
- Consider radon – Cook County can support, incidence rate has decreased with new ASHRAE standards due to improved ventilation

2. Evaluation Topics:

- Recommendation to put evaluation funding into incentives, reducing evaluation on low income programs as much as possible
- Evaluation to be discussed after filing, within evaluation planning process

3. NEBs:

- ComEd intends to evaluate NEBs, ideally including benefits to improve low income program cost effectiveness

4. Education:

- Education should be thought of separately from typical marketing and outreach
- Measuring education effectiveness – include in evaluation

5. Marketing and Outreach:

- Measuring marketing effectiveness – include in evaluation
- Think outside of just marketing and outreach, consider meeting people where they are, building trust, who the messenger is
- Multiple messengers in the community – multiple audiences with unique characteristics
- Faith based organizations can be very effective, well trusted

6. Terminology:

- Prefer terms other than “low income” –
 - “Economically disadvantaged”
 - Hardship area
 - Income-eligible
 - Enhanced - more positive

7. Expanded Eligibility / Enrollment

- While households may income-qualify, barriers to participation are often too high
- “Pre-launch” outreach – pre-qualify / enroll ahead of time, using community organizations
- Organizations can identify customers, help qualify

- Study done on “financial health” – strict income limits may not be sufficient to determine low income customer segment:
 - <http://cfsinnovation.org/research/eight-ways-to-measure-financial-health/>

8. Multi-family:

- Qualify with 66% of residents as income-eligible
- Voucher programs are not fully captured/covered, needs attention

9. Targeting areas

- Qualifying areas based on census tract income-eligibility
 - Good practice, but neighborhoods turn over to higher income residents quickly; may be ways to segment in order to exclude higher income areas (Juliana Pino)
- Target lowest income segment for highest impact and most expensive measures – air sealing/insulation, HVAC
- Build awareness within neighborhoods/communities (Kelly Shelton, Faith in Place)
 - Door-to-door outreach / door hangers in area where projects are completed
 - Program branding recognition

10. Branding

- ComEd has found using their brand, over generic, is more beneficial
- In low income communities, there are concerns with utility brand, other organizations – residents are often distrustful, see utility and believe service is being shut off
- Co-branding opportunities – program name, with trusted organization and utility
 - Energizing Indiana as example – statewide branding for multiple utilities and partners
- Utility brand does add validity – especially with concern around third-parties conducting outreach to customers to change suppliers
- ComEd marketing and outreach for the Smart Grid was successful – leverage best practices and initiatives
- DCEO – branded as the organization conducting the work

11. Trust

- Building awareness and trust within neighborhoods, communities is important – impacting marketing, outreach, enrollment

12. Program Designs

- Affordable Housing New Construction:

- Most developers know who receives income-eligible tax breaks, funding, etc., so know who to target – 66% low income eligibility may not be necessary.
- Housing authorities, agencies can share properties that qualify for other programs to help target
- Outreach to municipalities is also necessary – manage properties after construction
- Question: What is happening with projects that are in the pipeline (whether in application process, awarded grant, etc.) – ComEd is serving; consideration should be made for construction planned for this summer, with IHDA funding in progress
- Single-family and multi-family retrofit programs:
 - ComEd-served homes/properties will be additive to IHWAP
 - Need to expand health/safety/structural improvement funds for single-family
 - Concerns around on-bill financing (OBF) – addition of cost to bill for low income customers is not ideal; OBF will only be offered for “other” improvements, as EE projects will be 100% funded
- LED Distribution:
 - Consider distribution to townships
- Home Energy Reports:
 - Why is this targeted?
 - An easy, low cost way to help customers save energy
 - Recommendations are tailored to low income community, not focused on costly improvements/changes
 - Consider offering reports in other languages

Next Steps and Follow Up Items:

Note: Majority of discussion is ongoing

1. Committee Input on Average Health/Safety/Repair Costs

- ComEd estimates an average of \$500 per home.
- **Action Item:** Does \$500 on average align with Committee members' experience?

2. Committee Input on Program Capacity

- Potential participation (total customers) will help shape budgets.

- **Action Item:** ComEd requested input on what potential capacity programs may have – what volume of customers is realistic for each?

Ameren IL Presentation –

Summary Notes and Recommendations:

1. Code Compliance

- There is a lack of code compliance in Ameren IL territory
- IHWAP agrees – refers customers to other programs for non-EE issues that cannot be addressed under program
- Legislation does not require utilities to address code compliance – EE offers should consider new appliance and building standards, rather than correct lack of compliance
- EE programs' goal is not to spend significant amounts of money to repair issues, but rather complete issues that are inhibiting projects from moving forward that can be easily resolved
- Pre-screening is important – CEDA has process in place

2. Moderate Income

- 66% of the residential budget is being allocated to low income and moderate income customers
- 20% Copay for moderate income customers – is that too high?
- IHWAP serves up to 200% of poverty level with no copay, does not have statistics on whether customers could afford a copay, but some moderate income customers are served under free program

Next Steps and Follow Up Items:

1. Code Compliance

- **Action Item:** Follow up needed on how repair issues, code compliance is being addressed but current implementers, explore how utilities can approach moving forward.

2. Job Growth Opportunities

- **Action Item:** SAG Facilitation to coordinate addition job training, neighborhood development as a future meeting topic.

3. Moderate Income – 20% Copay

- **Action Item:** Additional stakeholder input requested.
- **Action Item:** Does the Ameren IL current moderate income programs include a copay? Are they successful?

4. On-Bill Financing Availability to Moderate Income Customers

- **Action Item:** Will on-bill financing be available to moderate income customers to help cover the cost of a copay?

5. Gas Budget – Low Income vs. Moderate Income

- **Action Item:** Additional detail requested by stakeholders on the budget allocated to low income customers, versus moderate income customers.

6. Gas Budget Shortfalls – Electric Spend Potential

- **Action Item:** Potential for electric funds to be spent in order to offer more comprehensive/whole home (gas and electric) projects – With a smaller gas budget, stakeholders suggested Ameren IL consider spending electric budget on gas measures per the statute that allows electric funds to cover gas expenses, and savings claimed.

Current Schedule:

Date	Meeting / Milestone	Location (if applicable)
Monday, May 1 and Tuesday, May 2, 2017	SAG Meetings – to include utility presentations on low income programs	Midwest Energy Efficiency Alliance, 20 N Wacker Drive, Suite 1301, Chicago, IL 60606
Tuesday, May 23, 2017	Committee Meeting – Review utility plans	Springfield, IL
Thursday, June 1, 2017	“Bridge Period” begins – transition of current DCEO programs to utilities	n/a
Tuesday, June 6, 2017	Committee Meeting – Identify areas of consensus/non-consensus on program filings	Chicago Metro (tentative – South Chicago)
Friday, June 30, 2017	Utility filings due	n/a

Follow-Up Meeting
Tuesday, April 18, 2017
Ameren IL Presentation Conclusion

Meeting notes incorporated to the April 11, 2017 notes and action items, above

Attendees

Ashley Palladino, SAG Facilitation
Agnes Mrozowski, Ameren Illinois
Alison Giangrasso, CLEARResult
Andrew Cottrell, Applied Energy Group
Andrey Gribovich, DNVGL
Angie Ziec-Malek, CLEARResult
Antonia Ornelas, Elevate Energy
Rev. Booker Steven Vance, Faith in Place
Bridgid Lutz, Nicor Gas
Brittany Zwicker, CLEARResult
Bryan Tillman, 360 Energy Group
C Tenorio, ComEd
Cheryl Miller, Ameren IL
Chris Vaughn, Nicor Gas
Christie Hicks, Environmental Defense Fund
Craig Catallo
David Baker, Energy Resources Center, UIC
Debra Perry, Ameren IL
Erin Daughton, ComEd
Erin Stitz, Applied Energy Group (AEG), on behalf of Peoples Gas – North Shore Gas (PG-NSG)
Gary Ambach, Seventh Wave
Jen Morris, ICC Staff
Jim Heffron, Franklin Energy, on behalf of PG-NSG
John Madziarczyk, Nicor Gas
Jonathan Feipel
Julia Friedman, MEEA
K.C. Doyle, Cook County, Department of Environmental Control
Karen Lusson, IL Attorney General's Office
Kate Brown, Building Research Council, University of Illinois Urbana - Champaign
Kathleen Walk, CEFS Economic Opportunity Corporation
Keith Martin, Ameren IL
Koby Bailey, PG-NSG
Laura Goldberg, NRDC

Lauren Casentini, Resource Innovations
Lauren Pashayan, Land of Lincoln Legal Assistance Foundation
Mike Brandt, ComEd
Mike King, Nicor Gas
Mindy Browning, Embarras River Basin Agency, Inc.
Molly Lunn, Department
Noelle Gillbreath, CIC Chicago
Patricia Plympton, Navigant
Peter Ludwig, Elevate Energy
Philip Mosenthal, Optimal Energy on behalf of the AG's Office
Randy Gunn, Navigant
Rob Neumann, Navigant
Scott Allen, CUB
Susan Sams, Ameren IL
Tish, Burnside, PCCEO
Wade Morehead, CLEAResult