Nicor Gas Energy Efficiency Programs

Summary of Deemed NTG Values for GPY1 through GPY7

Updated to include Final NTG Values for GPY7

March 1, 2017

Table of Contents

Home Energy Efficiency Rebate	2
Advanced (Smart) Thermostats defined in the Illinois TRM	5
Home Energy Savings for Low and Moderate Income	5
Home Energy Savings	6
energySMART Energy Saving Kits	7
Elementary Energy Education	8
Behavioral Energy Savings	9
Residential New Construction	10
Multifamily Program	11
Small Business Energy Savings	12
Business Energy Efficiency Rebate Program	15
Business Custom Incentive Program	16
Combined Heat and Power	17
Strategic Energy Management (SEM)	17
Retro-Commissioning	18
Business New Construction Service	19
NO CLAIMED SAVINGS: Nicor Gas Emerging Technologies Program	20
DISCONTINUED: Behavioral Energy Savings-Energy Buzz	21
DISCONTINUED: Nicor Gas Economic Redevelopment	21

Net to Gross Methodology References:

Illinois TRM version 5.01 NTG methodologies Illinois TRM version 6.02 NTG methodologies

¹ Illinois Statewide Technical Reference Manual for Energy Efficiency (TRM) Version 5.0 (effective 6/1/2016). Available: http://www.ilsag.info/technical-reference-manual.html. See *Volume 4: Cross-Cutting Measures and Attachment.*

² Illinois Statewide Technical Reference Manual for Energy Efficiency (TRM) Version 6.0, February 8, 2017, *Volume 4: Cross-Cutting Measures and Attachments.* Available: http://www.ilsag.info/technical-reference-manual.html.

	Home Energy Efficiency Rebate
GPY1	NTG 0.69
	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 6%
	Method: Evaluation research consisting of customer self-report data from 74 program
	participants and 53 participating trade allies.
GPY2	NTG 0.69
	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 6%
CDV/2	Method: SAG deemed based on GPY1 research.
GPY3	NTG 0.79
	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 16% Method: SAC deemed based on CDV1 research and spillover adjustment of 0.10
GPY4	Method: SAG deemed based on GPY1 research and spillover adjustment of 0.10. NTG 0.79
GI 14	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 16%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 0.79
	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 16%
	Method: No new research. Values based on GPY1 (free-ridership and spillover) and GPY3
	(spillover adder).
GPY6	NTG 0.79
	Free-ridership 37%
	Spillover 16%
	Method: No new research. Values based on GPY1 (free-ridership and spillover) and GPY3
	(spillover adder). Program NTG value of 0.79 may be used for an "HVAC Saves" furnace
	quality installation pilot/program.
GPY7	Home Energy Efficiency Rebates (all measures, excluding Duct Sealing, Air Sealing, and
	Insulation Measures)
	NTG: 0.68
	This NTG value is not recommended for air sealing, insulation, or duct sealing.
	Free ridership: 0.45
	Method: Value is from GPY5 evaluation telephone survey research conducted with 100
	GPY4 HEER Program participants. The FR result is based on applying TRM v6.0 NTG
	methodologies. The overall program FR value uses GPY4 HEER Program verified gross
	savings to weight measure category free ridership: AFUE 95 (FR=0.40, weight=69%);
	AFUE 97 (FR=0.44, weight=14%); other measures in survey (FR is not based on enough
	responses to report statistically significant results at the measure level, weight = 17%).
	Program measures that were not researched were assigned the overall FR average.
	•

Navigant described our concerns with the TRM v5.0 NTG algorithm and offered an alternative approach in an August 23, 2016 memo. Our alternative was not adopted for TRM v6.0, but the approach that did make it into TRM v6.0 addresses what we believed were weaknesses of TRM v5.0 and produces results similar to our August 23 recommended alternative. Navigant recommends the algorithm in TRM v6.0 over the algorithm in TRM v5.0 to estimate free ridership for residential prescriptive rebate programs. A Navigant memo dated December 22, 2016 provides further discussion.

Participant Spillover: 0.02

Method: The PSO value is from GPY5 evaluation telephone survey research conducted with 100 GPY4 HEER Program participants. The PSO result is based on applying the TRM v5.0 methodologies to identify spillover candidates, and estimating spillover savings using the Illinois TRM and Nicor Gas program data from GPY4. The TRM version 6.0 participant spillover methodology advises using a lower, more inclusive spillover threshold score of 5.0 rather than 7.0. Navigant re-examined our survey responses applying a threshold of 5.0, but no additional gas spillover was found. A Navigant memo dated December 16, 2016 provides further discussion.

Non-Participant Spillover: 0.11

Method: Non-participant spillover value for GPY7 is based on GPY2 evaluation research conducted for Peoples Gas (PGL) and North Shore Gas (NSG) to estimate spillover from non-participating trade allies. For statewide consistency, the methodology and survey instrument were derived from evaluation research completed for Ameren Illinois by Cadmus. For the spillover calculation, 59 interviews were conducted sampled from two groups of non-participating trade allies: 1) Trade allies that dropped out of the PGL or NSG program (so-called "drop out" trade allies): those who had participated in GPY1, but did not participate in GPY2; and 2) True non-participating trade allies - those who reported that they were aware of the PGL and NSG program, but had never participated. The value of 0.11 is a weighted average of 0.10 for Peoples Gas and 0.13 for NSG.

Navigant recommends the NPSO value from GPY2 PGL & NSG research rather than the GPY1 Nicor Gas research value of 0.06 for these reasons: 1) the GPY2 methodology was consistent with evaluation research conducted for Ameren Illinois, 2) the GPY2 sample was slightly larger, and it was observed that trade allies overlap utility service territories, 3) GPY2 is the more recent study, and 4) it is logical that non-participants after the second program year better represent future non-participants than research conducted on a first-year population of a program ramping up.

Home Energy Efficiency Rebates (all measures, excluding Programmable Thermostats, Duct Sealing, Air Sealing, and Insulation Measures)

NTG: 0.72

Free ridership: 0.41

Method: Value is from GPY5 evaluation telephone survey research conducted with 100 GPY4 HEER Program participants. The FR result is based on applying TRM v6.0 NTG methodologies. The FR value shown excludes programmable thermostats from the NTG weighting. Results and weighting for furnaces: AFUE 95 (FR=0.40, wgt: 83%); AFUE 97 (FR=0.44, wgt: 17%). This NTG value may be used for an overall program NTG for measures excluding programmable thermostats, air sealing, insulation, and duct sealing

(that is, for furnaces, boilers, tankless water heaters, and other space heating and water heating equipment).

Participant Spillover: 0.02 (described above) **Non-Participant Spillover:** 0.11 (described above)

For Duct Sealing, Air Sealing, and Insulation

NTG: 0.90

Free ridership: 0.10 Spillover: 0.00

Method: The free ridership value was taken from the "Home Energy Savings Program GPY2/EPY5 Evaluation Report" prepared for Nicor Gas and ComEd (Navigant, 3/25/2014). Results for Nicor Gas for the weatherization component were: FR=0.10. No recommendation was made for spillover.

Navigant concludes the researched overall HEER Program NTG (either 0.68 or 0.72) is not reasonable for duct sealing, air sealing, and insulation. Duct sealing, air sealing, and insulation FR and PSO research is planned for Peoples Gas and North Shore Gas for the first half of 2017. Navigant may recommend updated free ridership and spillover values using data from the PGL & NSG Home Energy Rebate Program survey planned for the first half of 2017 if results are final prior to May 30, 2017.

	Advanced (Smart) Thermostats defined in the Illinois TRM
GPY6	NTG Not Applicable
	Method: Research for TRM Version 5.0 savings value was conducted as a large sample
	regression analysis of energy use data with a control group. Natural gas savings shown in
	TRM Version 5.0 Section 5.3.16 are net savings; no additional NTG adjustment is applied.
GPY7	NTG: Not Applicable
	Method : No new research. The natural gas heating savings shown in Illinois TRM Version 6.0
	Section 5.3.16 is based on regression analysis on energy use data and thus is a net savings
	number; no additional NTG adjustment is applied.

	Home Energy Savings for Low and Moderate Income
GPY6	Overall NTG 1.00
	Method: SAG consensus.
GPY7	NTG: 1.00
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	1
	Home Energy Savings
GPY1	Overall NTG 0.86
	Overall Free ridership 0.15
	Overall Spillover 0.01
	Method : Customer self-reports. 54 full-participant (direct install and weatherization
	measures) surveys completed from a population of 1,081 audits and 320 full-participants.
GPY2	NTG 0.86
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio.
GPY3	NTG 0.86
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio.
GPY4	NTG 0.86
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method : NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 1.05
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 14%
	Method: Documented in the GPY2 Home Energy Savings evaluation report. Free ridership
	values from GPY1 full-participant research, and updated spillover values based on GPY2
	full participant (n=104) and assessment-only participant surveys (n=68). The evaluation also
	used trade ally free ridership and spillover feedback that was combined with participant
	results.
GPY6	NTG 1.05
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 14%
	Method : No change to values from GPY5. Program NTG value of 1.05 may be used for a
	Deep (comprehensive energy efficiency) Home Energy Assessment retrofit pilot/program.
GPY7	NTG: 1.05
	Method : No new research. Retained GPY6 final value. As in GPY6, the program NTG value
	of 1.05 may be used for a Deep (comprehensive energy efficiency) Home Energy Assessment
	retrofit pilot/program.

	T
	energySMART Energy Saving Kits
GPY1	NA
	Launched in GPY3
GPY2	NA
	Launched in GPY3
GPY3	NTG 0.84
	Free ridership 16%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: GPY3 program participant self-report data, drawn from analysis of 75 interviews.
GPY4	NTG 0.84
	Free ridership 16%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed and reported in Table 14 of the Nicor Gas filed
	Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 0.84
	Free ridership 16%
	Spillover 0%
	Method : GPY3 program participant self-report data, drawn from analysis of 75 interviews.
GPY6	NTG 0.84
	Free ridership 16%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: No change to values from GPY5.
GPY7	NTG: 0.84
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	Elementary Energy Education
GPY1	NTG 0.68 - 0.96 (varies by measure and participant group)
	Free ridership 0.18-0.53
	Spillover 0.07-0.19
	Method : Customer self-report, 223 surveys completed from a population of 9,972.
GPY2	NTG 0.79
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio
GPY3	NTG 0.79
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio
GPY4	NTG 0.79
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in
	Table 14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 1.05
	Free ridership 0.14
	Spillover 0.19
	Method : No new Illinois research. Free-ridership was estimated as the average of values
	from three Elementary Energy Education impact evaluation reports (weighted 2/3
	showerheads, 1/3 aerators): NIPSCO (FR=12%; final report June 2013), Nicor Gas Rider 29
	(FR=3%; final report September 2011), and GPY1 Nicor Gas (FR=27%; final report (July
	2013). Rider 29 did not estimate spillover; the spillover is the average of results from
	NIPSCO (SO=21.5%) and GPY1 Nicor Gas (SO=17%).
GPY6	Program NTG: 1.00
	Water Efficient Showerheads NTG 1.00
	Water Efficient Kitchen Aerators NTG 1.00
	Water Efficient Bath Aerators NTG 1.00
	Method: Based on SAG consensus.
GPY7	Program NTG: 1.00
	Method : No new research. Retained GPY6 final value. Program value applies to all natural
	gas saving measures offered through the program, including Water Efficient Showerheads;
	Water Efficient Kitchen Aerators; Water Efficient Bath Aerators; Water Heater Setback, and
	Shower Timers.

	Dehavieral Energy Cavings
	Behavioral Energy Savings
GPY1	NA NA
	Launched in GPY3
GPY2	NA
	Launched in GPY3
GPY3	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: GPY3 billing analysis will yield a net savings value that includes FR and
	participant SO impacts.
GPY4	NA
GPY5	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: GPY5 billing analysis will yield a net savings value that includes FR and
	participant SO impacts.
GPY6	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: GPY6 billing analysis will yield a net savings value that includes FR and
	participant SO impacts.
GPY7	NTG: Not applicable when the natural gas savings calculated by evaluation is based on
	regression analysis on energy use data and thus is a net savings number; no additional NTG
	adjustment is applied.
	^^
-	

	Residential New Construction
GPY1	NTG not evaluated. Program just launched. No impact evaluation.
GPY2	NTG 0.80; Free ridership 0.20; Spillover 0.00
	Method : SAG deemed NTG ratio. The 0.80 NTG was a planning value assigned to the first
	full year of the program, based on relevant research available at that time (including CPUC
	NTG=0.80). Preliminary NTG research was conducted on GPY2 builders based on a small
	sample (seven builders). The GPY2 preliminary research was not used in setting NTG
	values because it was based on then current building practices compared with the 2009 code,
	and not the more stringent 2012 code that was coming into force. Evaluation concluded the
	free-ridership value would not be representative of the more stringent 2012 code.
GPY3	NTG 0.80; Free ridership 0.20; Spillover 0.00
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio.
GPY4	NTG 0.80; Free ridership 0.20; Spillover 0.00
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 1.00; Free ridership N/A; Spillover N/A
	Method : No new Illinois research. Navigant examined recent research to assess whether to
	update the previous values, given that the program will have been operating for four years
	in GPY5, and should be creating spillover and market effects. Secondary research on more
	mature residential new construction programs (including MA Res NC (NTG=1.18), National Grid RI (NTG=1.0), CPS Energy Savers (NTG=1.0), and Navigant/ODC/Arizona Public
	Service RNC market effects 2011 IEPEC paper) found that spillover and market effects are a
	significant component of the NTG value so that NTGRs are commonly 1.0 or higher.
	Consensus conclusion was that the GPY5 RNC NTG value be 1.00, with the expectation that
	spillover and market effects will offset free-ridership.
GPY6	NTG: 0.65
01 10	Free ridership: 0.39
	Participant Spillover: 0.04
	Non-Participant Spillover: No value for non-participating builders
	Method: Navigant conducted interviews with builders and raters who participated in
	GPY4/EPY7 and GPY3/EPY6 in the winter of 2015 and used data from these interviews to
	estimate free-ridership and spillover for the program. Research included three measure
	areas: framing and insulation, HVAC, and other. Navigant interviewed a total of twelve
	builders (participant pop. 38) and six raters (participant pop. 11) representing 45 percent and
	67 percent of homes in the GPY4/EPY7 program, respectively. Three of the builder
	interviewees represented nearly 80 percent of the interviewed builders' homes; however, the
	overall program participation is heavily skewed towards a small number of builders as well.
	In GPY4/EPY7, the top five (of 38) builders represented 80 percent of program homes.
	This research resulted in an overall range of NTG estimates from 0.39 to 0.65 for gas and 0.35
	to 0.63 for electric. Given the uncertainty around self-reported NTG results and ongoing
	program efforts to reduce free-ridership, Navigant recommended using the maximum NTG
CDV7	values for prospective GPY6 application.
GPY7	NTG: 0.65 Method: No powy research. Retained CPV6 final yellyo
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	Multifamily Program
GPY1	Program NTG: 0.95
	Water Efficient Showerheads NTG 0.95
	Water Efficient Kitchen Aerators NTG 0.95
	Water Efficient Bath Aerators NTG 0.95
	Research Method: Participant self-report. CATI telephone survey with participating
	decision-makers (20 property managers).
GPY2	Dwelling Unit NTG 0.96
	Common Area NTG 0.93
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed. Values based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY3	Dwelling Unit NTG 0.96
	Common Area NTG 0.93
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed. Values based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY4	Dwelling Unit NTG 0.96
	Common Area NTG 0.93
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in
	Table 14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	Dwelling Unit NTG 0.95
	Free ridership: 0.07
	Spillover: 0.02
	Comprehensive/Common Area NTG 0.94
	Free ridership 0.08
	Spillover 0.02
	Method : GPY3 participant self-report. CATI telephone survey with participating GPY3
	decision-makers (74 property owners/managers).
GPY6	Dwelling Unit Direct Install NTG 0.95
	Free ridership: 0.07
	Spillover: 0.02
	Comprehensive/Common Area NTG 0.94
	Free ridership: 0.08
	Spillover: 0.02
	Method : GPY3 participant self-report. CATI telephone survey with participating GPY3
	decision-makers (74 property owners/managers).
GPY7	Dwelling Unit Direct Install NTG: 0.95
	Comprehensive/Common Area NTG: 0.94
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final values.

	Small Business Energy Savings
GPY1	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership 2%
	Spillover 2%
	Method: Customer self-report combined with trade ally input. 24 participant surveys
	completed from a population of 272. Basic method of participant free-ridership analysis was
	used. No participant spillover was found. Customer participant self-reported free-ridership
	was 20 percent for Nicor. Individual trade ally responses (representing over 80% of PY1
	program savings) to free-ridership questions were weighted by their respective fuel-specific
	program savings contributions and combined for a fuel-specific maximum overall free-
	ridership rate. This approach resulted in an evaluation estimate of 0.02 free-ridership for gas
	measures that was balanced by spillover of 0.02 resulting in a NTG ratio of 1.00 for Nicor.
GPY2	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership 2%
	Spillover 2%
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY3	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership 2%
	Spillover 2%
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY4	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership 2%
	Spillover 2%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 0.93
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 2%
	Method : The GPY5 NTG value uses an equal-weight average of the free-ridership estimate
	from participant survey research performed on ComEd participants during EPY7 with the
	free-ridership estimate derived from Nicor Gas trade ally interviews in GPY1. For participant
	spillover, the EPY7 ComEd result was 2%, the Nicor Gas GPY1 result was 2%, and PGL/NSG
	GPY1 result was 1%. A value of 2% for participant spillover was set for all three utilities. This
	results in a NTGR of 0.93. For ComEd PY7 NTG research, Navigant conducted a CATI survey
	of 70 program projects drawn at random from a sample frame of 4,441 projects with ex-ante
	savings of 5,000 kWh or greater, representing 82 percent of PY7 projects and 98 percent of PY7
	expected savings. Sample size chosen to attain +/- 10 percent precision at 90 percent
	confidence.

GPY6 NTG 0.93 for Direct Install, Retrofit (custom and prescriptive projects).

Free ridership 0.09; average of participant (0.16) and trade ally (0.03)

Participant Spillover 0.02

Non-Participant Spillover 0.00

Method: The GPY6 NTG value uses an equal-weight average of the 16 percent free-ridership estimate from participant survey research performed on ComEd participants during EPY7 (described in GPY5 above) with the three percent free-ridership estimate derived from PGL and NSG trade ally interviews in GPY4. The PGL and NSG GPY4 trade ally free ridership is based on 12 trade ally interviews from a population of 55. The GPY4 trade ally interviews found no spillover. The GPY4 PGL & NSG trade ally free ridership was considered the best available research value for Nicor Gas, based on similarities in program design and measure mix, and trade ally overlap.

For participant spillover, the EPY7 ComEd result was 2%, the Nicor Gas GPY1 result was 2%, and PG/NSG GPY1 result was 1%. A value of 2% for participant spillover was set for all three utilities.

GPY7

Direct Installation: NTG 0.87; Free ridership 0.14, average of participant (0.23) and trade ally (0.06); Participant Spillover: 0.01; Non-Participant Spillover 0.00.

Prescriptive Rebates: NTG 0.81; Free ridership 0.20, average of participant (0.34) and trade ally (0.06); Participant Spillover: 0.01; Non-Participant Spillover 0.00.

Custom Incentives: NTG 0.88; Free ridership 0.13, average of participant (0.21) and trade ally (0.06); Participant Spillover: 0.01; Non-Participant Spillover 0.00.

Comprehensive Project Roll-up Average: NTG 0.81; Free ridership 0.20, average of participant (0.34) and trade ally (0.06); Participant Spillover: 0.01; Non-Participant Spillover 0.00.

Method: Participant free ridership values are from GPY5 evaluation research conducted by CATI telephone survey with GPY5 decision-makers for these two paths: 30 respondents for direct install (90/6); 40 respondents for prescriptive rebates (90/7). The GPY5 research applied the TRM v6.0 NTG algorithms.

Due to the small population of Small Business custom projects, the GPY5 research completed only five Small Business custom project participant interviews, achieving a 90/23 result. Participant FR research conducted on the GPY5 Business Custom Program produced a free ridership estimate of 0.21, at 90/12, and 0.21 is judged to be the best available value for a custom path-level free ridership. The GPY5 Business Custom Program research used TRM v6.0 NTG algorithms.

Participant spillover of 0.01 is a program-level research result from 75 interviews with Small Business Program GPY5 participants. The GPY5 research applied the TRM v6.0 NTG algorithms.

Interviews with 10 trade allies representing 81 percent of program therm savings produced a free ridership value of 0.06, applicable at the program-level, but did not find evidence of PSO or NPSO.

The comprehensive roll-up NTG value covers Direct Install, Prescriptive, and Custom Small Business path participants. Participant free ridership of 0.34 is a program-level research result from 75 interviews with Small Business Program GPY5 participants, weighted by GPY5 path savings. The GPY5 research applied the TRM v6.0 NTG algorithms. The roll-up NTG value may be used instead of the path-level NTGs.

	Business Energy Efficiency Rebate Program
GPY1	NTG 0.73
	Free ridership 0.27
	Spillover 0.00
	Method: Customer self-report: 34 surveys completed from a population of 146. Standard
	Rigor approach. No quantifiable participant spillover was found from customer self-reports.
GPY2	NTG 0.73
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: SAG approved NTG ratio based on GPY1 research.
GPY3	NTG 0.83
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 10%
	Method: SAG approved NTG ratio based on GPY1 free-ridership research and deemed
	spillover.
GPY4	NTG 0.83
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 10%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 0.68
	Free ridership 35%
	Participant Spillover 1%
	Non-Participant Spillover: 2%
	Method: NTG ratio based on GPY4 free-ridership and participant spillover research
	consisting of interviews with 44 GPY3 customer participants and 20 GPY3 trade ally
	participants. Standard Rigor approach. Non-participant spillover drawn from GPY2 research
	consisting of 31 non-participating trade ally interviews.
GPY6	NTG 0.68
	Free ridership 35%
	Participant Spillover 1%
	Non-Participant Spillover: 2%
	Method: NTG ratio based on GPY4 free-ridership and participant spillover research. Non-
	participant spillover drawn from GPY2 research consisting of 31 non-participating trade ally
	interviews.
GPY7	NTG: 0.68
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	Business Custom Incentive Program
GPY1	NTG: 0.53
	Free ridership 47%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: Customer self-report: 11 surveys completed from a population of 28.
	Standard Rigor approach. Trade allies called for 3 participants and their responses factored in
	to the customer free ridership calculation.
GPY2	NTG: 0.72
	Free ridership 28%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: Evaluation research consisting of GPY2 participating customer self-reports. Free-
	ridership of 28% and participant spillover of 0% from 16 participating customer NTG
	interviews completed from a population of 73 projects. Standard Rigor approach.
GPY3	NTG: 0.73
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 0%
	Method : Evaluation research consisting of 7 participating GPY3 customer self-reports, with
	the program level estimate based on combining samples and populations from GPY2 and
	GPY3. Standard Rigor approach.
GPY4	NTG: 0.53
	Free ridership 47%
	Spillover 0%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY1, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG: 0.73
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 0%
CDV/	Method: Values from GPY3 evaluation research.
GPY6	NTG: 0.73
	Free ridership 27%
	Spillover 0% Method: Values from CDV2 evaluation research
GPY7	Method: Values from GPY3 evaluation research. NTG: 0.79
GF 17	
	Free ridership: 0.21 Participant Spillover: 0.00
	Non-Participant Spillover: 0.00
	Non-1 articipant Spinover. 0.00
	Method : Participant free ridership and participant spillover are from GPY5 survey research
	that produced a free ridership of 0.21 based on 14 interviews (90/12) and no spillover,
	applying TRM v6.0 NTG methodologies. Interviews with 8 trade allies did not find evidence
	of PSO or NPSO. The GPY5 research applied the TRM v6.0 NTG algorithms.
	1 01100 0111100. The Of 10 research applied the final volution algorithms.

	Combined Heat and Power
GPY5	Launched in GPY5
	NTG 0.73
	Free ridership 0.73
	Spillover 0.00
	Method: GPY5 NTG value for Nicor Gas Custom Program.
GPY6	NTG: Project-specific NTG values to be determined by evaluation early in each project. If
	that is not possible, the default of 0.80 NTG will be used.
	Method: NTG of 0.80 is an average based on evaluation secondary research and NYSERDA's
	0.90 NTG.
GPY7	NTG: Project-specific NTG values to be determined by evaluation early in each project. If
	that is not possible, the default of 0.80 NTG will be used.
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 approach.

	Strategic Energy Management (SEM)
GPY5	Launched in GPY5
	NTG 0.91
	Free ridership 0.09
	Spillover 0.00
	Method: Free-ridership value from GPY5 Nicor Gas Retro-Commissioning. The non-
	participant spillover value is set at zero. The SEM NTG value applies only to incremental
	savings attributed to the SEM program that are not accounted for in other programs.
GPY6	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership: NA
	Participant Spillover: NA
	Non-Participant Spillover: NA
	Method: SAG consensus value. Program NTG value would apply to other cohorts (for
	example, healthcare) as well as industrial. For equipment measures identified through SEM
	that are channeled through other incentive programs, use the NTG of the program
	processing the equipment incentive.
GPY7	NTG: 1.00
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	Retro-Commissioning
GPY1	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: Customer and service provider self-report.
	NTG based on GPY1 research – 11 participants with gas savings and eight of nine service
	providers surveyed. Enhanced method. Participant and Service Provider spillover
	researched.
GPY2	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY3	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY4	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: No new research. Values based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY6	NTG 1.02
	Free ridership 9%
	Spillover 11%
	Method: No new research. Values based on GPY1 evaluation research.
GPY7	NTG: 1.02
	Method: No new research. Retained GPY6 final value.

	Business New Construction Service
GPY1	NTG 0.33
	Free ridership 67%
	Spillover 0%
	Method : Customer self-report for all projects. Interviews with individuals representing 4 of 7
	projects with gas incentives. NTG scores were adjusted for standard design national retail
	stores and LEED projects.
GPY2	NTG 0.52
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on electric program evaluation results from EPY4.
GPY3	NTG 0.52
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: SAG deemed NTG ratio based on electric program evaluation results from EPY4.
GPY4	NTG 0.52
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: NTG values for GPY4 were deemed using values from GPY3, and reported in Table
	14 of the Nicor Gas filed Energy Efficiency Plan for GPY4-GPY6.
GPY5	NTG 0.92
	Free ridership 8%
	Spillover 0%
	Method : Gas-weighted free-ridership and spillover results from participant interviews
	conducted for the Nicor Gas and ComEd GPY3/EPY6 Business New Construction Program
	evaluation.
GPY6	NTG 0.67
	Method: FR, PSO, and NPSO research conducted for Nicor Gas and ComEd for GPY4/EPY7
	resulted in a NTG of 0.57 for gas. SAG consensus for GPY6 is a three-year average of 0.52,
	0.92, and 0.57. Also applies to small business new construction.
GPY7	NTG: 0.77
	Method: Research conducted for ComEd and gas utility program partners for GPY5/EPY8
	resulted in a NTG ratio of 0.83 for natural gas measures. SAG consensus for GPY6 and GPY7
	was to use a three-year average of the most recent research values. For GPY7, the three most
	recent research values are: 0.92, 0.57, and 0.83, producing an average of 0.77. The NTG value
	also applies to small business new construction.

	NO CLANATE CANDING NI C. E
	NO CLAIMED SAVINGS: Nicor Gas Emerging Technologies
	Program
GPY1	NTG N/A
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: N/A
	This program feeds other C&I programs; any impacts were attributed to the relevant
	program.
GPY2	NTG 1.00
through	Free ridership N/A
GPY5	Spillover N/A
	Method: The NTG ratio was deemed by SAG.
GPY6	NTG 1.00
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: Use value from GPY2 through GPY5.
GPY7	NTG: No Recommendation.
	Method: No new research. No natural gas savings were claimed in GPY5 or GPY6. If the
	program changes from GPY6 and savings will be claimed in GPY7, then evaluation will
	make a recommendation based on the GPY7 program design.

	DISCONTINUED: Behavioral Energy Savings-Energy Buzz
GPY1	NTG N/A
	Free-ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: PY1 had no impacts due to late launch.
GPY2	NTG N/A
	Free-ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: GPY2 found a net savings value of 26 therms per participant based on secondary
	research.
GPY3	NTG N/A
	Free-ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: GPY3 will use a deemed net savings value of 26 therms per participant based on
	GPY2 secondary research.
GPY4	Discontinued.

	DISCONTINUED: Nicor Gas Economic Redevelopment
GPY1	NTG 0.8 (planning value)
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: Due to the small number of projects completed in PY1, Navigant used the planning
	NTG value of 0.8.
GPY2	NTG 0.70
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: The NTG ratio was deemed by SAG.
GPY3	NTG 0.70
	Free ridership N/A
	Spillover N/A
	Method: The NTG ratio was deemed by SAG.
GPY4	Discontinued as a separate program.