

IL EE Stakeholder Advisory Group

Tuesday, June 23rd 2015

10:30 am – 4:30pm

Large Group SAG Meeting Attendee List and Meeting Notes

Midwest Energy Efficiency Alliance (MEEA)
20 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 1301, Chicago

Call-In Number: 760-569-6000; access code 844452#

Webinar: <https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/9031238242095821057>

Agenda

Time	Agenda Item	Discussion Leader
10:30 – 10:40	Opening and Introductions	Annette Beitel, EE SAG Facilitator
10:40 – 12:40	<p>IL TRM Version 5.0</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of proposed high/medium/low priority measures. <p>Purpose: To determine final list of high/medium/low priority measures by July 1st.</p>	Annette Beitel, EE SAG Facilitator
12:40 – 1:10	Lunch	
1:10 – 2:00	<p>Smart T-stat Collaborative and ComEd Home Energy Savings Program</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Overview of collaborative (participants, issues/challenges discussed). ComEd Home Energy Savings Program smart t-stat offering. Savings and evaluation issues. Retail channel options. <p>Purpose: To educate SAG.</p>	Noel Corral, ComEd; John Paul Jewell, ELPC
2:00 – 3:30	<p>Update on IL EE Successes Fact Sheet – Report-out to SAG</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review updated final draft fact sheet; data collected. Plan for updating fact sheet. <p>EE Jobs Multipliers</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussion of EE jobs multiplier research. Subcommittee recommendations. 	<p><i>Report-out to SAG:</i> Jim Jerozal, Nicor Gas</p> <p><i>EE Jobs Multipliers:</i> Karen Winter-Nelson, SEDAC; Ashley Harrington, 360 Energy Group</p> <p><i>Additional methodologies:</i> Ian Adams, Clean Energy</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Additional methodologies. • Next steps. <p>Purpose: To report-out to SAG.</p>	Trust; BW Research (invited); ACEEE (Casey Bell); Center for Strategic Economic Research (invited)
3:30 – 3:45	Break	
3:45 – 4:20	<p>SAG Schedule Update and Status of SAG Subcommittees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Status of SAG Subcommittees. • SAG Schedule for 2015-2016. • Should SAG report to the Commission on an annual basis? <p>Purpose: To educate SAG.</p>	Annette Beitel, EE SAG Facilitator
4:20 – 4:30	Closing	Annette Beitel, EE SAG Facilitator

Attendee List

Annette Beitel, EE SAG Facilitator
Celia Johnson, SAG Senior Policy Analyst
Roger Baker, ComEd
Hammad Chaudhry, Nicor Gas
Kristol Whatley, Ameren IL
Chris Vaughn, Nicor Gas
Jim Jerozal, Nicor Gas
Randy Gunn, Navigant
Carla Colamonici, CUB
Laura Goldberg, CUB
Rob Neumann, Navigant
Pat Michalkiewicz, Peoples Gas-North Shore Gas
David Baker, ERC/UIC, on behalf of DCEO
Angie Ziech-Malek, CLEAResult
Ashley Harrington, 360 Energy Group
Nick Dreher, MEEA
Dan Lefevers, GTI
Stefano Galiasso, ERC/UIC, on behalf of DCEO
Jeffrey Walters, Metropolitan Mayors Caucus
Arelene Hass, Elevate Energy
Suzanne Stelmasek, Elevate Energy
Molly Lunn, DCEO
Noel Corral, ComEd
John Paul Jewell, ELPC
Mary Ellen Guest, Chicago Bungalow
Ted Weaver, First Tracks Consulting, on behalf of Nicor Gas
Casey Bell, ACEEE
Andrea Reiff, DCEO
Byron Lloyd, DCEO
Brian Bowen, First Fuel

Tim Melloch
Bill Provencher, Navigant
Patrick Giordano, Giordano & Associates
Sam Mueller, Nexant
Vincent Gutierrez, ComEd
Jeff Erickson, Navigant
Keith Goerss, Ameren IL
Ben Lipscomb, CLEAResult
Karen Lusson, IL AG
Andy Robinson, DCEO
Domenico Gelonese, Embertec
Deirdre Coughlin, DCEO
Rick Bain, Embertec
Ken Woolcutt, Ameren IL
Jim Fay, ComEd
Arturo Hernandez, ComEd
Kristol Whatley, Ameren IL
Hannah Arnold, Opinion Dynamics
Carl Uthe, Embertec
Rich Hackner, GDS Associates
Travis Hinck, GDS Associates
Bridgid Lutz, Nicor Gas
John Madziarczyk, Nicor Gas
Kevin Grabner, Navigant
Jennifer Morris, ICC Staff
Ryan Hoger, TEC
Andrew Cottrell, AEG
Philip Mosenthal, Optimal Energy, on behalf of IL AG
Paige Knutsen, Franklin Energy, on behalf of Peoples Gas-North Shore Gas
Douglas Rossin, DNV-GL
Karen Kaminsky, Elevate Energy
Wade Morehead, CSG
Jeremy Offenstein, ADM Energy
Monika Jesionek, ADM Energy
Joshua Goffin, CLEAResult
James Gowen, ADM Energy
George Roemer, Franklin Energy
Jane Colby, Cadmus Group
Shraddha Mutyal, ERC/UIC
Chelsea Lamar, Navigant
Sue Nathan, AEG
Thad Carlson, Trickle Star

Meeting Notes

Follow-up items are indicated in **yellow highlight**.

Technical Advisory Committee

TRM Measure Tracker Next Steps

- If anyone has additional items to consider, please add it to the tracker by Wednesday COB. If new topics are submitted, we will hold a teleconference meeting on Tuesday (9-10am). Otherwise another meeting will not be held.
- **Celia to update the tracker based on the changes made in this meeting.**

Afternoon Meeting

Smart T-stat Discussion (John Paul Jewell, ELPC; Noel Corral, ComEd)

- There are varying definitions of “smart” thermostats.
- Ryan Hoger, TEC: Why is this limited in scope to occupancy control smart t-stats? There are other smart t-stat options.
 - Noel Corral, ComEd: This is a place to start. This is a market that will continue to expand, and get re-defined as new t-stats come into the market.
- How are the savings being determined? What is the study design?
 - Bill Provencher, Navigant: The evaluation method is based on matching with regression estimation, over a 12-month period (May 2014 – April 2015). The timeline for a draft evaluation is 7 weeks following the data collection completion.
 - kW, kWh, and therms
 - Preliminary draft may be ready in late August.
 - Do you expect the savings to be different for Navigant based on NIPSCO/Vectren?
 - Bill Provencher, Navigant: It depends on the data results.
- Is it an opt-in pilot?
 - Noel, ComEd: Yes this is an opt-in program for residential. We are also looking at small business.
- Three different delivery channels and incentives, with different launch dates from July to October 2015.
- How does the installer ensure the smart t-stat is the right fit for the particular homeowner?
 - Noel Corral, ComEd: This is in the works right now. We are trying to get as much info before we get into the house, to determine if the smart t-stat is the right fit for the customer – such as, do they have WiFi? There will be training for installers, for manufacturer and utility Trade Allies.
- There are three products on the market that meet the requirements – Nest, Honeywell Lyric, and Ecobee 3.
 - Ecobee 3 includes an extra sensor.
 - Honeywell Lyric uses geo-fencing.
- Cost-Effectiveness: Why is there such a big difference in estimated TRC scores?
 - Roger Baker, ComEd: This is more of a program-TRC than a measure-level TRC.
 - Hammad C., Nicor Gas: In the ET program, TRC ranged from 1.88 and 3.9 depending on the cost. The sample size was apx. 70 homes.
- Marketing campaign messaging will be further developed by mid-July.
- Randy Gunn, Navigant: Savings may change over time.

- Bill Provencher, Navigant: One concern about deeming is this measure evolving over time. This number will represent the best estimate of savings.
- Will the savings be representative of Ameren IL's service territory?
 - Bill Provencher, Navigant: That is a reasonable assumption.
 - Randy Gunn, Navigant: There may be weather considerations.
 - Phil Mosenthal, Optimal Energy, on behalf of IL AG: Agreed. We don't know about the persistence of savings and how it might change over time.
- How does this impact the participation in programs?
 - Noel Corral, ComEd: This is just another measure in that program channel. For direct install, 10% is the participation amount assumed.
- Rob Kelter, ELPC: Suggests looking at the programmable t-stat measure again. The current measure in the IL-TRM assumes zero savings. Add this to the TRM tracker.
- Next step – Discuss Navigant's smart t-stat evaluation at the September SAG meeting. Nicor Gas to present on Emerging Technology Program t-stat results.

IL EE Successes Report-out (Jim Jerozal, Nicor Gas); EE Jobs Multipliers (Karen Winter-Nelson, SEDAC; Ashley Harrington, 360 Energy Group; Ian Adams, Clean Energy Trust; Casey Bell, ACEEE)

- Cost-effectiveness – moved to Successes Fact Sheet Version 2.
- Is there a reason not to include Chicagoland Program savings?
 - The Chicagoland Program was not evaluated.
- Nicor Gas study used actual GPY1-3 spending amounts, using completed project cost (beyond incentives). Also used actual savings recorded.
- Molly Lunn, DCEO: These models are based on the models DCEO uses.
- Casey Bell, ACEEE: Indirect, direct, and induced tends to vary. They are captured within a lot of data that supports input/output models. We also look at jobs that result from the investment in energy efficiency, and also jobs that are created throughout the economy. Both of these shifts in spending patterns account for direct/indirect/induced jobs. A single multiplier may be an incomplete way to estimate.
- Casey Bell, ACEEE:
 - ACEEE is working on a project to provide guidelines for a method on the ex post verification of EE programs. They are looking at net jobs, rather than gross jobs. The project is not yet completed (est. completion September 2015).
 - There are a number of varying and divergent approaches to EE job multipliers.
 - ACEEE currently does not have a jobs multiplier recommendation to use; a previous spreadsheet for states to use was taken down after realizing the numbers were not realistic.
 - Keys to establishing an EE jobs estimate –
 - Consistency of the narrative
 - Changes in spending throughout the economy
- Randy Gunn, Navigant: Are the number of jobs in EE clear at the national level?
 - Casey Bell, ACEEE: I don't think it is a clear-cut case. It relies heavily on your definition of "job." It depends on your assumptions as to what sectors are included.
- Rob Neumann, Navigant: Recommends reducing the jobs number by 10% for a conservative estimate.
- Feedback – what are participants' thoughts on approaches for the EE jobs multiplier?
 - David Baker, ERC/UIC: Why not cite another study that has come up with its own estimate (such as Clean Energy Trust), instead of coming up with a multiplier?

- Stefano Galiasso, ERC/UIC: If funds were not spend in the EE economy, but spent elsewhere, there would be a net loss of employed people (aka jobs). This supports the net impacts of EE.
- Molly Lunn, DCEO: Agrees it makes sense to stick with CET number. However, it minimizes the impact of programs in IL. Suggests looking at what ACEEE puts out in September; what will that methodology look like? Decide whether it is something we can pursue for IL.
 - If SAG doesn't decide to do this, the state will look at this either way.
- Randy Gunn, Navigant: It would also be helpful to show the job impacts of EEPS. Other states are debating EE funding; it's important to look at this in advance of this coming to IL in the future.
- Pat Michalkiewicz, PG-NSG: If there is a way to include the jobs number that is being used in another state, we should go there, but if it's not, we shouldn't include it. Concerned about people focusing on a jobs number instead of the EE reporting.
- Other suggestions:
 - Randy Gunn, Navigant: How much have these programs saved real people?
 - Savings for real people – Version 2.0.
 - How does this compare to other states?
 - Version 2.0.
 - Randy Gunn, Navigant: This document should include C/E information.
 - Keith Martin, Ameren IL: We should put our facts on the table; actual results. The audience for this is broad. We should be careful not to create doubt about our accomplishments by including controversial info.
 - Molly Lunn, DCEO: Legislators are interested in the economic impacts of programs. It's important that we can demonstrate these programs save IL consumers \$.
 - Karen Winter-Nelson, SEDAC: We have lifetime savings; all we need is to create a cost per kWh, cost per therm.
 - Next step: Do not include a jobs multiplier number in Successes Fact Sheet Version 1. ACEEE will publish their suggested method for jobs in September 2015; follow-up on this discussion for Version 2.
- Next Steps on Successes Fact Sheet Version 1:
 - 1) Clean up document/circulate to SAG for review. Add final version 1 to website and circulate notice.
 - 2) For version 2 (anticipated to begin in October 2015), Subcommittee to discuss:
 - Dollar savings (cost-effectiveness)
 - Jobs multiplier follow-up
 - How does Illinois compare to other states?
 - How will the Successes Subcommittee disseminate Fact Sheet information?