

**Illinois EE Stakeholder Advisory Group  
Large Group SAG: Evaluation Plan Meeting (Day 1)**

**Tuesday, December 5, 2023 Teleconference  
9:30 am – 12:00 pm**

**Attendees and Meeting Notes**

<b>Meeting Materials .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Attendees (by webinar).....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Opening &amp; Introductions .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Closing and Next Steps .....</b>	<b>3</b>

**Meeting Materials**

Meeting materials are posted on the [December 5](#) page of the SAG website:

- [Tuesday, December 5 SAG Evaluation Plan Meeting Agenda](#)
- [Opinion Dynamics Presentation: Ameren Illinois 2024 Energy Efficiency Portfolio Evaluation Plan](#)
- [Guidehouse Presentation: 2024-2025 ComEd Evaluation Plan](#)

**Attendees**

Celia Johnson, SAG Facilitator  
Caty Lamadrid, Inova Energy Group (SAG Meeting Support)  
AJ Young, Greenlink  
Abby Miner, IL Attorney General's Office  
Alan Elliott, Opinion Dynamics  
Andrey Gribovich, DNV  
Andy Vaughn, Leidos  
Arvind Singh, DNV  
Brent Nakayama, Leidos  
Brittin Wood, Anura Energy  
Carina Paton, Frontier Energy  
Cassidy Kraimer, Community Investment Corp.  
Chris Neme, Energy Futures Group, representing NRDC  
Christian Koch, MEEA  
Clark Korbisch, Power Takeoff  
David Brightwell, ICC Staff  
Deb Dynako, Slipstream  
Dena Jefferson, Franklin Energy  
Elizabeth Horne, ICC Staff  
Erin Stitz, Applied Energy Group  
Gregory Norris, Aces 4 Youth  
Hannah Collins, Leidos  
Hannah Howard, Opinion Dynamics  
Houston Downen, Frontier Energy  
Jamey Neal, Ameren Illinois  
Jarred Nordhus, Peoples Gas & North Shore Gas  
Jason Fegley, Ameren Illinois  
Jeff Erickson, Guidehouse  
Jim Fay, ComEd

John Carroll, Ameren Illinois  
John Lavallee, Ameren Illinois  
Karen Lusson, National Consumer Law Center (NCLC)  
Kate Shonk, Citizens Utility Board  
Kathryn Brewer, CLEAResult  
Keely Hughes, The JPI Group  
Ken Parker, Community Investment Corp.  
Kim Janas, IL Attorney General's Office  
LaJuana Garrett, Nicor Gas  
Lance Escue, Ameren Illinois  
Larry Kotewa, Elevate  
Laura Agapay-Read, Guidehouse  
Libby Stevenson, Ameren Illinois  
Lorraine Renta, Guidehouse  
Matt Armstrong, Ameren Illinois  
Michael Brandt, Elevate  
Miritza Thorpe, Ameren Illinois  
Monique Leonard, Ameren Illinois  
Nate Yemm, Leidos  
Nicholas Crowder, Ameren Illinois  
Nick Warnecke, Ameren Illinois  
Nicole Popejoy, IACAA  
Nikki Pacific, Ameren Illinois  
Patrice Suggs McFarlin, SEEL  
Philip Halliburton, ComEd  
Philip Mosenthal, Optimal Energy, representing IL AG and NCLC  
Randy Opdyke, Nicor Gas  
Ryan Kroll, Driftless Energy  
Ryan Wall, Guidehouse  
Sagar Phalke, Guidehouse  
Sam Dent, VEIC (IL-TRM Administrator)  
Sam Stahl, Ameren Illinois  
Scott Eckel, ICC  
Seth Craigo-Snell, SCS Analytics  
Shane Perry, Ameren Illinois  
Stacia Dreyer, Opinion Dynamics  
Thomas Drea, Ameren Illinois  
Tim Dickison, Ameren Illinois  
Tyler Sellner, Opinion Dynamics  
Will Wilson, Leidos  
Zach Ross, Opinion Dynamics

### **Opening & Introductions**

*Celia Johnson, SAG Facilitator*

**Purpose:** For the Ameren Illinois and ComEd evaluators to provide an overview of and request feedback on draft evaluation plans (EM&V work plans) for the 2024 program year, including updates on 2024-2025 evaluation activities.

- Annual process that is held each December, where independent evaluators present an overview of their draft EM&V plans for each utility to the SAG.
- SAG participants are encouraged to ask questions and share feedback.
- Draft evaluation plans will be circulated for written comment to SAG by December 15.

### **Ameren Illinois Evaluation Plan**

*Zach Ross, Alan Elliott, Tyler Sellner and Stacia Dreyer Opinion Dynamics*

#### **Material: [Opinion Dynamics Presentation: Ameren Illinois 2024 Energy Efficiency Portfolio Evaluation Plan](#)**

- On an annual basis Opinion Dynamics must complete impact evaluation, process evaluation and market research for Ameren Illinois' programs. In addition, every year we estimate employment impacts and other non-energy benefits. There is also an annual retrospective verification of cost-effectiveness and research to help update the IL Technical Reference Manual.
- There is ongoing collaboration with Guidehouse in their evaluation of other utilities. This is done through monthly coordination meetings, the SAG, and other Working Groups. For 2024 there is collaborative research planned on Compressed Air Leak Repair and Food Service net to gross (NTG) values.
- Slide 8 – The Ameren IL portfolio is split into three programs: residential, business and voltage optimizations. Programs are further subdivided into initiatives, and then into channels. Ameren is the only dual-fuel utility in IL.
- Slide 12 – Retail Products Initiative. This is the largest program that reaches the most customers. The last evaluation survey conducted was in 2020 so there are several measures that have not been evaluated in a few years. In 2024 we will be updating values. Given the size of the effort, surveys for this initiative provide an opportunity to collect market information from many customers. We will focus part of our survey on assessing electrification opportunities, and gaging customer's attitudes and interest around fuel-switching.

*Chris Neme: Are evaluation activities just impact evaluation or also process?*

*Alan Elliott: The slides and presentation focus on the "special" evaluation tasks that we are completing, but on the top right corner of slide you can see what is happening for both process and Impact. The survey we are conducting will address both.*

*Chris Neme: What measures is this initiative addressing?*

*Alan Elliott: There is lighting for income qualified (IQ) participants, but also many other measures: advanced thermostats, HP, HVAC, weatherization kits, advanced power strips. The list of measures evaluated will be documented in the plan. There are some new measures like dishwasher and clothes washers that have not been evaluated before.*

- Slide 13 – Midstream HVAC Channel. Incentives are provided to distributors and are passed down to contractors and then end-users through reduced sales prices. Last year, Opinion Dynamics did significant research on distributors and contractors. Results were submitted to NTG Working Group, and noted that we had some concerns around the

level and quality of responses. In 2024 we want to go back in the field with new samples to get more completed surveys and new answers.

*Chris Neme: When you look at market effects are you able to get impacts for non-participating distributors and contractors?*

*Alan Elliott: We are only looking at participating distributors and contractors.*

*Zach Ross: Ameren feels that the majority of the distributor market is in their program already, so we will not be doing non-participating distributors but we will try to get information from non-participating contractors.*

*Chris Neme: Many of the products are sold by big box stores like Lowes and Home Depot. Do they participate in the program?*

*Alan Elliott: I think there is some overlap between the Retail Products and Midstream HVAC Channels for Heat Pump Water Heaters but not other measures.*

*Chris Neme: To the extent that there are sales going through Home Depot the program is not capturing those, because they are outside of the influence of the product. These are not included in the Retail Products suite of discounts.*

- Slide 14 – Home Efficiency Channel. Homeowner pays for some costs out of pocket, which presents a barrier to participation. This channel has not received a comprehensive evaluation. We will focus on customer satisfaction, how they paid for projects (upfront cash, financing, credit card, etc.), and we will determine participant awareness of Inflation Reduction Act (IRA) Tax Credits. For partial participants that did not go through their building shell plan, we will explore the reason for this and ability to access financing.

*Ken Parker: Who provides the scope of work to a customer?*

*Alan Elliott: A BPI-certified program ally with experience doing assessment goes out to their home, provides direct installation of measures, and develops a scope of work for building shell retrofits.*

*Chris Neme: Do we know what the follow-through rate is?*

*Alan Elliott: this is a research question.*

*Ken Parker: Many times, the credits customers receive are not enough incentive to follow-through with the improvements. Do utilities have a way to increase incentives on top of tax credits for 2024?*

*Alan Elliott: The decision to increase incentives would rest with Ameren taking into consideration the research that we are doing. This is a likely theory for why there is not much participation.*

*Chris Neme: Zach Ross mentioned that customers are not even going to the first level of participation, so that also begs the question of why that is the case. Are you trying to identify the barriers to that first step and why there are not many assessments going?*

*Alan Elliot: We are doing the customer surveys this year and contractors survey next years, so we can also review the program ally aspect. We think program allies prefer to do the IQ work where everything is paid for and it is easier to sell the projects and so they are not doing the work under this program.*

- Slide 15 – Kits Initiatives. This is a conglomeration of different channels: middle school, high school, IQ community. We decided to focus on school and high school kits to investigate the curriculum piece further, in-class activities, and student reception. For process evaluation we are doing a survey with teachers.
- Slide 17 – Income Qualified Single-Family Initiatives. We will do our basic core evaluation activities and some additional focused activities including a process valuation for the Community Action Agency staffing pilot. Under IQ Smart Savers that offers no-cost installations to some customers in defined zip codes, we will conduct program ally interviews, especially for those working with self-reliance pilots.
  - For community kits, we are doing basic impact evaluation. For Healthier Homes we will do program design review and in-depth interviews with delivery partners and NEI research.
  - For the Accessibility pilot, this is a new pilot that provides smart and connected energy efficiency products to customers with disabilities, and that aims to improve mobility and independence while conserving energy. For this we have in-depth interviews with delivery partners an NEI research.
- Slide 18 –This is a large initiative. This year we are focusing on the new pilots that came out in 2023 and provide feedback on how pilots can be optimized. We will conduct interviews with Ameren and implementation staff.
- Slide 19 – Multi Family Initiative. There are three initiatives that are combined for evaluation purposes, we will conduct our yearly impact evaluation, complete some NTG research for Market Rate MF
- Slide 20 - Multi Family Initiative. We will conduct a holistic review of three segments. We will investigate the feasibility of conducting a full evaluation of the One Stop Shop (OSS) model that connects all initiatives.

*Chris Neme: What questions are you are trying to answer with this evaluation? I would like to find out why were aren't more major measures being installed in MF IQ buildings. Not many are getting building envelop measures... why are there missed opportunities?*

*Stacia Dreyer: In 2025 we will look at why there are not more properties being treated. In 2024 we can start building the answers through our staff interviews to start understanding why they think there isn't much participation. I will talk to my team to see how we can better address that question.*

*Chris Neme: I am talking about participants, who are mainly getting direct install measures. I want to know why they are not pursuing more building envelope measures or HVAC measures.*

*Phil Mosenthal: I second what Chris is saying. This is one of my bigger concerns, I think it is more than surveying participants but it is worthwhile to do on-site visits and try and see if in fact the implementers are identifying all cost-effective opportunities and recommending them. And if they are, then why are they being followed-through. It is not*

*just building shell measures, but also mechanical and lighting systems that appear to not being addressed.*

*John Carroll: We believe the primary barrier is that customers have already participated. It is a very high percentage that we've insulated. If you look at the expiration on the measure life and when properties are eligible again, there are several properties that came in from 2014-2018 that are now eligible to receive measures. For these properties we are going back to, last time they received insulation and mechanical and maybe this year they are only getting DI.*

*Chris Neme: This surprises me because I thought we'd been struggling for years to get building shell measures in MF units. I think evaluators should look at this.*

- Slide 22 - Business Program structure refresher. Ameren has six initiatives under Business Program that are further broken into channels. Standard, Custom and Small Business are the primary drivers of savings, with Custom dominating gas savings. We will continue to do our annual impact evaluation of these but have a few resource-intensive evaluations that we need to do for RCx and Custom that require more complex engineering calculations and statistical modeling approaches.
- Slide 23 – Small Business Initiative. There are two channels: DI and Energy Performance that specifically targets customers in disadvantaged communities. Given the newly passed NTG policy for activities in these communities we are deeming this value and so our NTG research will focus on activities in non-disadvantaged communities. This was last done in 2020 and needs updating.

*Phil Mosenthal: NTG values are high for this program, so does it make more sense to invest in Standard program NTG research and particularly interested in standard lighting in commercial program which there has not been a recent study?*

*Tyler Sellner: Research is ongoing, we are completing it in 2023.*

*Phil Mosenthal: It would be worth looking at how comprehensive these programs are in terms of measures installed beyond DI.*

- Slide 24 – Virtual Commissioning. We will launch surveys in spring 2024.
- Slide 25 – Custom Initiative. Couple of non-core scope activities planned, the first being NTG research that has not been completed since 2020 and setting aside funds to build upon a comprehensive process evaluation that is in progress right now. Though results are not ready, we are getting the impression that there might be valuable follow-up research that could be scoped out.

*Chris Neme: When is this 2023 work expected to be done?*

*Zach Ross: We will have a draft to Ameren by end of this year and then after back-and-forth we expect results will be posted publicly sometime in Q1.*

*Chris Neme: Interested if you are looking at the question of what caused a large customer to decide to stay in vs not (due to CEJA changes). I'm trying to figure out what could be done to get more of the large customers to find value in participating in the programs.*

*Tyler Sellner: We are also conducting research with energy advisors and are asking that question of that group. For custom process evaluation we are speaking with all engaged stakeholders both on program implementation and trade ally side to focus on what the key missed opportunities and challenges are right now.*

- Slide 27 – Voltage Optimization. Evaluation activities in 2024 are the same that have been done in prior years.
- Slide 29 – For Pilots and emerging work, we will focus on Luminaire Light Level Controls Market Transformation Initiative, VirtualSEM and Business Energy Analyzer. There is no defined scope yet, but we know that these efforts will occur in 2024.
- Slide 31 – Key Cross-Cutting Research and Evaluation Activities in 2024 include non-participating contractor research, controls, and commissioning of Heat Pumps on residential facilities. Others include non-energy impact updates, particularly related to societal air quality. For non-participants contractors, we are preparing a characterization study to understand how we can engage them – specially for diverse businesses there is significant support available and we want to test awareness and interest. This will be done as a survey focusing on zip codes or counties that are yet to be defined.

*Phil Mosenthal: Question about evaluation of the market development initiative. Is it too early to be doing more evaluation research?*

*Alan Elliott: There is an ongoing evaluation right now lead by JPI Group.*

*Celia Johnson: A presentation to the SAG Equity Subcommittee is planned in March.*

### **ComEd Evaluation Plan**

*Jeff Erickson, Lorraine Renta, and Sagar Phalke, Guidehouse*

#### **Materials:** [Guidehouse Presentation: 2024-2025 ComEd Evaluation Plan](#)

- Slide 6 – The full budget for evaluation. Some of this is not program-specific.
- Slide 8 – Residential Sector for both Market Rate and Income eligible components. There are two different programs: direct to consumer and channels, and they are divided further into subprograms. Income qualified efforts are embedded into the programs.
  - Direct to consumer programs:
    - Single Family Upgrades
    - Multifamily Upgrades
    - Behavior – residential / income eligible
  - Channel programs:
    - Retail / online
    - Product distribution
    - New Construction – income eligible
    - Electric Homes New Construction
    - Contractor / Midstream Rebates
- Slide 9 – Breakdown of residential sector program components. Anything in bright green is Income Qualified, in grey is Market Rate (MR) and light blue applies to both. In red text, anything that is new for 2024 compared to 2023. Our evaluation report is at the program level, but we do identify IQ savings separately.

- Slide 10 – We are doing an impact evaluation for all programs and their components in 2024. The new program evaluation for 2024 is the Electric Homes New Construction Channel.

*Chris Neme: The checkmarks show which programs in which years are getting an impact evaluation. Can you clarify what you mean by “impact evaluation”?*

*Lorraine Renta: For most of these programs we use the current year TRM and review the project data. For behavior we do traditional analysis with billing data involved.*

*Chris Neme: The only thing you might not do in 2025 that you do in 2024 is getting new data on measure retention rates? Or will you carefully review tracking system to ensure all assumptions are being applied?*

*Lorraine Renta: We still review data for reasonableness and if it looks very similar to previous year then we just apply known realization rates. But if we see abnormalities, we might do additional analysis.*

*Chris Neme: Those realization rates, are they close to 1?*

*Lorraine: They have been. But we review data to date every year and let the ComEd team check some parameters that may seem off. This is an opportunity to course-correct mid-year.*

- Slide 11 – Most programs got NTG evaluations in 2023. In 2024 we will focus on Single Family updates to market rate component where we will do customer free-ridership and spillover surveys.
- Slide 12 – On measure research, we will focus on measure Retail Online Program. There are cases where TRM-based assumptions rely on outdated data, so we will review deemed calculations. We also plan to survey limited time offer appliance rebate participants to determine whether separate in-service rate values should be applied in future years.
- Slide 13 – For pilots and MT programs, we expect to evaluate savings from the ENERGY STAR Retail Products Platform and all sectors of MT programs to get evaluation support.

*Karen Lusson: Are there any plans to evaluate market development initiative? I know it is a relatively small spend, but wonder if there is an evaluation plan forecasted to determine if this is effective?*

*Lorraine Renta: This is not an evaluation planned right now. We will discuss with ComEd.*

- Slide 15 – There are six business programs to be evaluated with three of them having multiple components.
  - Small Business
  - Incentives
    - Standard
    - Custom
  - Targeted Systems
    - RCx (including Building Operator Certification)

- Industrial Systems
  - Virtual Commissioning (VCx)
- Midstream / Upstream
  - Instant Discounts
  - Commercial Food Service Equipment
- Behavior Business / Public
  - Strategic Energy Management
- New Construction Business / Public
  - Non-residential new construction
- Slide 17 – NTG evaluations conducted in 2024 will be for free ridership and spillover customer survey as well as with Energy Efficiency Service Providers for RCx program.

*Phil Mosenthal: I see the focus in 2024 is on RCx program. It might be useful to also investigate how customers are behaving and whether they are overriding savings. This would help us inform lifetime.*

*Sagar Phalke: We will be conducting surveys and will look at ways to incorporate that into current research efforts.*

- Slide 18 – For the custom program we conduct NTG every year and we also plan standard incentive in 2024. The commercial food service component is relatively new, so it will be reviewed in 2025.
- Slide 19 – Business Pilots and Market Transformation Programs
- Slide 20 – Additional business research. Focus on industrial compressed air leak repair and the business energy analyzer savings research.
- Slide 22 – We will continue conducting non-energy impacts work. Some of this is required by CEJA and it is conducted annually. We also do societal health impact research every year and continue a longstanding participant impacts program to monetize health changes.

*Chris Neme: On participant impacts will the research continue to focus solely on health impacts or will you try to assess other non-energy benefits will comfort improvements?*

*Jeff Erickson: We have a method established to monetize health impacts, but not really comfort.*

*Chris Neme: On economic development impacts, my recollection is the plan was to use a model and multipliers for future years. When is the next time we will look at the model?*

*Jeff Erickson: Correct. This coming year we are using the same multipliers. 2026 would be next time the full study is conducted.*

- Slides 23-24 – There is a new policy established by the recent Policy Manual update, for NTG in disadvantaged areas. Slide 24 details the nuance behind this policy.
- Slide 25 – Top of mind is electrification. Many electrification measures are expected in residential programs, predominantly in income-eligible programs. We are working with ComEd to figure out how TRM and Policy Manual on electrification works. This work will continue in 2024.
- Slide 26 – We work with ComEd's data to demonstrate to PJM energy savings produced.

- Slide 27 – Describes how evaluation is conducted.

### **Closing and Next Steps**

*Celia Johnson, SAG Facilitator*

- SAG participants will have an opportunity to review and provide comments on written draft EM&V work plans. Draft EM&V work plans will be posted on the SAG website and circulated to SAG by December 15.